

Reverend Carlos Urrutigoity

Biographical Information

YEAR OF BIRTH:	Unknown
YEAR OF DEATH:	N/A
ORDINATION:	July 22, 1991

Employment/Assignment History

5/24/1998	Decree issued by Bishop James C. Timlin establishing the Society of St John
	Urrutigoity not issued a religious assignment
4/2002	Removed from active ministry

Summary

The Society of St. Pius X (“SSPX”) was founded in 1970 by a retired missionary bishop, Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre, in order to perpetuate the traditional liturgical rites of the church. In 1971, a seminary was started in Ecône, Switzerland in order to train priests for the SSPX. Despite being specifically warned by the Pope not to ordain them, the founder ordained the first seminarians to the priesthood in 1976. Those ordinations were valid, but illicit. Pope Paul VI immediately suspended the founder’s faculties and those of the men he had ordained.

In 1988, the founder sought an agreement with the Holy See for the lawful continuation of SSPX and an agreement was reached. The founder then broke the agreement, in an act that was schismatic, by ordaining four bishops without papal mandate. This action incurred an automatic ex-communication that was later lifted by Pope Benedict XVI. However, until the status of the Society was regularized by the Holy See, the bishops and priests remained suspended from the exercise of Holy Orders.

In 1989, some SSPX clergy and seminarians who did not want to go into schism (separation from the church), sought an agreement with the Holy See. The agreement resulted in the founding of the Priestly Fraternity of St. Peter (“FSSP”).

In an effort to return disaffected members of the SSPX to membership in the Catholic Church, Bishop James C. Timlin interviewed a group of men who claimed that they were seeking to return to the true church. The group of men called themselves the Society of St. John and included four priests: Carlos Urrutigoity, Eric Ensey, Daniel Fullerton and Marshall Roberts. There were no background checks or reviews of their seminary or priestly formation records at that time. Timlin presumed that the SSPX had prepared the men for ordination by adhering to the standards that were established by that organization. Father Urrutigoity and Father Ensey were subsequently incardinated into the Diocese. Timlin had the censures lifted and the priests took up residence with the FSSP in Elmhurst.

The FSSP established St. Gregory's Academy, a high school for boys, with FSSP headquarters located in the same building as the high school. While residing there, Ensey served as chaplain at the Academy during the 1997-1998 and the 1998-1999 school years. He and other members of the FSSP served as teachers at the Academy.

On May 24, 1998, Timlin issued a decree formally establishing the Society of St. John ("SSJ") as a public association of the faithful in the Diocese. SSJ informed Timlin of its intent to establish a Catholic community wherein lay people who were committed to the rites of the 1962 missal would live in close connection with the SSJ. The members also wanted to establish a college and Timlin approved this request. This decision went against the recommendation of Diocesan officials.

On September 16, 1999, SSJ, with Timlin's permission, purchased one thousand acres in Shohola, Pike County. The real estate was not placed in the Bishop's name as was the practice with all Diocesan property, however. Complaints were subsequently made to the Diocese that the SSJ was spending money beyond their means. Timlin, in turn, explored ways to assist the SSJ.

On September 15, 2001, Timlin was informed that Urrutigoity had made it a practice to sleep in the same bed with boys and young men. Timlin immediately questioned Urrutigoity who denied any immoral behavior. Urrutigoity did admit that there may have been occasions when overcrowded conditions prompted shared sleeping arrangements. Timlin ordered Urrutigoity to stop the behavior and the allegation was brought before the Diocesan Review Board. Because there was no specific complaint, however, the Board believed that Timlin's instruction was all that could be done.

On January 12, 2002, Timlin received correspondence from a representative of the Pope. Attached was a letter written by a victim's father accusing Urrutigoity and Ensey of sexual misconduct. Father Clay, who was staying at the Shohola property, was also accused. These allegations were investigated by the Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office. However, because the statute of limitations had expired, no criminal charges were filed against Urrutigoity and Ensey. Clay's case was referred to the Pike County District Attorney's Office but no criminal charges were ever filed.

The Diocese, along with Urrutigoity and Ensey, were ultimately sued by the minor victim. The victim received a \$380,000 settlement.

Urrutigoity, Ensey and Clay were sent for clinical assessments and removed from active ministry, pending the outcome of the diocese investigation.

With respect to Ensey, the panel determined that Ensey did commit the grave delict of sexual abuse of a minor. The clinical assessments of Urrutigoity and Ensey resulted in the determination that neither one should be engaged in active ministry involving children.

Timlin reinstated Clay. Clay declined the appointment, however, and was granted a leave of absence. Clay ultimately moved to the Diocese of Fort Worth, Texas, where he became active in a Catholic Church.

While awaiting an investigation by the Diocese, Ensey travelled to Canada where it was learned that he was active in a Catholic Church. He was also involved in soliciting donations for the reinstatement of the SSJ in Paraguay.

Clay and Ensey's participation in another Diocese after decrees had been issued whereby they were forbidden to be part of any active ministry created negative publicity both for the Diocese of Scranton and the Dioceses where they were living.

In May, 2003, the Society had a debt of \$2,650,000. On July 25, 2003, the Holy See announced that Bishop Joseph Martino had been appointed to the See of Scranton. Prior to Martino's installation, Timlin authorized an arrangement with PNC Bank wherein the Diocese guaranteed a loan in the amount of \$2,650,000.

On November 19, 2004, Martino issued a decree suppressing the SSJ.

While awaiting the Diocesan investigation, Urrutigoity and Ensey requested to be excardinated from the Diocese so they could be incardinated by Bishop Livieres Plano into the Diocese of Ciudad del Este, Paraguay, with the hopes of re-establishing the SSJ. The request was initially denied. In 2008, however, Urrutigoity was excardinated from the Diocese and incardinated into the Diocese of Ciudad del Este, Paraguay. The Bishop of the Diocese of Ciudad del Este praised Urrutigoity, citing the letter written by Timlin wherein Timlin gave a glowing opinion of the SSJ and Urrutigoity. The SSJ was re-created in Paraguay and Urrutigoity was promoted to second in charge under Plano. In 2014, the Vatican initiated an investigation into Urrutigoity and Plano. Urrutigoity was removed as second in command and Plano was removed as Bishop.